

Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorney Fees

Al-Haramain Islamic Found. Oregon et al. v. Obama et al.
(07-cv-109-VRW) (3:06-md-1791-VRW)

Appendix 5

DUPLICATIVE HOURS BY ATTORNEY

Appendix 5 - Duplicative Hours by Counsel

The following spreadsheet lists the counsel who worked on an identified project in the case (*e.g.*, complaint, motion) and sets forth a calculation of the combined hours that all counsel worked on the project. This combined duplicative number of hours is then reduced by 25%. Estimates of time devoted to a particular project were made by taking the number of hours in a block entry that identifies the subject area of the project (*e.g.*, complaint) and dividing by the number of subject areas identified in block. More than one discrete activity that relates to work on the same project is treated as one subject area (*e.g.*, research, writing, analysis, review of defendants' motion, and prepare opposition to motion, is treated as one subject area for purposes of this calculation). These estimates for duplicative hours attempt to account for separate reductions made for consultations with co-counsel in Appendix 4 by treating consultations as a separate activity added to the divisor (thus reducing the amount of time attributed to the particular project). For example, an entry indicating that counsel researched and drafted a work product (*e.g.*, complaint) and consulted with co-counsel, for a total of 18 hours, is treated as 9 hours for work on the complaint.

Note: Page references in the chart are to the page numbers indicated in the ECF generated header at the **top** of the declaration cited.

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

*Obama**Duplicative Hours*

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Complaint</i>	Albies	2/5/06 - 2/27/06	2	18.3	9.1	Albies Decl. 3:10-11
	Eisenberg	2/27/2006	2	1	0.5	Eisenberg Decl. 5:14-15
	Goldberg	12/16/05-2/28/06	2	12.2	6.1	Goldberg Decl. 5:2
	Hassan	2/19/06-2/28/06	2	10.6	5.3	Hassan Decl. 3:26-27
	Nelson	12/16/05-2/28/06	1	96	96	Nelson Decl. 7:4-10
				TOTAL:	117	
<i>Recusal Judge</i>	Eisenberg	3/2/06-3/7/06	2	1.7	0.85	Eisenberg Decl.5:16-17
	Goldberg	2/28/06-12/20/06	2	3.4	1.7	Goldberg Decl. 5:5-6
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19
				TOTAL:	15.67	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

*Obama**Duplicative Hours*

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Preparation of Discovery; Motion to Compel</i>	Albies	3/2/06-4/17/06	5	54.8	10.96	Albies Decl. 3:13-15
	Albies	5/16/06-8/29/06	4	52.5	13.13	Albies Decl. 3:22-24
	Eisenberg	3/18/06-4/14/06	5	26.5	5.3	Eisenberg Decl. 5:20-22
	Eisenberg	5/3/06-5/21/06	2	7.2	3.6	Eisenberg Decl. 5:27-28
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	2	11	5.5	Goldberg Decl. 5:21-22
	Goldberg	7/2/06-9/22/06	1	18	18	Goldberg Decl. 6:7-8
	Goldberg	7/1/06-8/29/06	3	23	7.6	Goldberg Decl.6:9-13
	Goldberg	3/14/07-3/27/07	5	17	3.4	Goldberg Decl. 6:24-28
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	8	21.5	2.7	Hassan Decl. 4:1-4
	Hassan	5/26/06-6/28/06	2	5.4	2.7	Hassan Decl. 4:26-27
	Jaskol	5/17/06-9/14/06	4	7.3	1.8	Jaskol Decl. 5:1-3
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

*Obama**Duplicative Hours*

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Nelson	3/25/06-5/1/06	5	112.1	22.42	Nelson Decl. 8:1-2
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelson Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	127.13	
<i>Opposition to Ex Parte Filing by USG</i>						
	Albies	4/18/06 - 4/23/06	3	33.5	11.2	Albies Decl. 3:16-18
	Albies	5/16/06-8/29/06	1	1	1	Albies Decl.3:25-26
	Eisenberg	4/18/06-5/22/06	2	70	35	Eisenberg Decl.5:23-24
	Eisenberg	5/25/06-5/26/06	2	1.5	0.75	Eisenberg Decl. 6:1-2
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	5	10.9	2.18	Goldberg Decl.5:15-18
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	2	15.5	7.75	Goldberg Decl. 5:10-14
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	34	8.5	Goldberg Decl. 5:7-9
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	8	21.5	2.7	Hassan Decl. 4:1-4
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	46.1	11.5	Hassan Decl. 4:7-13

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Jaskol	4/19/06-5/25/06	1	21.5	21.5	Jaskol Decl. 4:25-28
	Nelson	3/25/06-5/1/06	5	112.1	22.42	Nelson Decl. 8:1-2
				TOTAL:	124.5	
<i>Plaintiffs Access to Sealed Documents</i>						
	Albies	3/2/06-4/17/06	5	54.8	10.96	Albies Decl. 3:13-15
	Albies	3/2/06-4/17/06	4	52.5	13.13	Albies Decl. 3:22-24
	Eisenberg	5/28/06-6/16/06	2	55.7	27.85	Eisenberg Decl. 6:3-5
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	34	8.5	Goldberg Decl. 5:7-9
	Goldberg	5/28/06-6/7/06	2	18	9	Goldberg Decl. 5:23-26
	Hassan	5/28/06-6/7/06	2	7.1	3.5	Hassan Decl. 4:14-16
	Jaskol	3/17/06-6/19/06	3	32.9	10.9	Jaskol Decl. 4:22-24

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

*Obama**Duplicative Hours*

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19
				TOTAL:	96.96	
<i>Oregonian Motion to Unseal</i>	Albies	4/18/06-4/23/06	3	33.5	11.2	Albies Decl. 3:16-18
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	2	15.5	7.75	Goldberg Decl. 5:10-14
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	5	10.9	2.18	Goldberg Decl.5:15-18
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	46.1	11.5	Hassan Decl. 4:7-13
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelson Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	62.65	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

*Obama**Duplicative Hours*

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Opposition to 2006 Motion to Dismiss</i>	Albies	5/16/06-8/29/06	4	52.5	13.13	Albies Decl. 3:22-24
	Eisenberg	6/12/06-7/4/06	2	66.5	33.25	Eisenberg Decl. 6:6-7
	Eisenberg	8/17/06-8/29/06	1	41.6	41.6	Eisenberg Decl. 6:15-16
	Goldberg	7/1/06-8/29/06	3	23	7.6	Goldberg Decl.6:9-13
	Hassan	7/1/06-8/29/06	4	21	5.25	Hassan Decl. 4:22-25
	Jaskol	6/6/09-9/7/06	3	26.3	8.76	Jaskol Decl. 5:10-13
				TOTAL:	109.59	
<i>Opposition to MDL Transfer</i>	Eisenberg	6/20/06-6/27/06	2	45.7	22.85	Eisenberg Decl.6:8-9
	Eisenberg	9/12/06-9/25/06	1	20.8	20.8	Eisenberg Decl. 6:22
	Eisenberg	10/24/06-10/26/06	1	10.1	10.1	Eisenberg Decl. 6:25
	Eisenberg	11/8/06-11/9/06	1	5.7	5.7	Eisenberg Decl.7:4-5
	Goldberg	6/21/06-10/28/06	2	22.5	11.25	Goldberg Decl. 6:1-3

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

*Obama**Duplicative Hours*

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Hassan	6/22/06-9/18/06	1	13.4	13.4	Hassan Decl. 4:17-21
	Jaskol	6/2/06-9/5/06	4	9.9	2.5	Jaskol Decl. 5:5-8
	Jaskol	9/21/06-11/9/06	1	13.4	13.4	Jaskol Decl. 5:20-22
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelson Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	116.9	
<i>Preparation Plaintiffs 2006 Partial Summary Judgment</i>						
	Albies	10/23/2006-11/1/06	2	30.5	15.25	Albies Decl.4:6-8
	Eisenberg	8/30/06-10/31/06	2	71.2	35.6	Eisenberg Decl. 6:20-21
	Goldberg	10/23/06-11/1/06	2	22	11	Goldberg Decl. 6:14-19
	Hancock	11/1/06-11/27/06	5	5.7	1.14	Hancock Decl. 4:6-7
	Hassan	9/7/06-11/1/06	5	18.6	3.72	Hassan Decl. 5:1-6

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Jaskol	10/23/06-10/27/06	2	5.6	2.8	Jaskol Decl. 5:23-25
				TOTAL:	69.51	
<i>Opposition to Petition for Interlocutory Review & Stay Pending Appeal</i>						
	Albies	8/18/06-9/25/06	2	5.6	2.8	Albies Decl.4:1-3
	Albies	9/25/06-10/24/06	2	27.9	13.95	Albies Decl.4:4-5
	Eisenberg	8/10/06-8/15/06	2	5	2.5	Eisenberg Decl. 6:12-14
	Eisenberg	9/20/06-11/1/06	2	44.3	22.15	Eisenberg Decl. 6:23-24
	Eisenberg	2/1/07-2/19/07	3	21.3	7.1	Eisenberg Decl. 7:26-27
	Eisenberg	3/26/07-3/28/07	1	23	23	Eisenberg Decl. 8:6-7
	Eisenberg	4/5/07-4/6/07	1	1	5.2	Eisenberg Decl. 8:8-9
	Goldberg	3/14/07-3/27/07	5	17	3.4	Goldberg Decl. 6:24-28
	Hancock	2/05/07-2/20/07	2	4.5	2.25	Hancock Decl. 4:10-11
	Hassan	9/7/06-11/17/06	2	12.7	6.35	Hassan Decl. 5:7-9

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Hassan	11/17/06-3/22/07	8	12.3	1.54	Hassan Decl. 5:11-15
	Hassan	3/24/07-4/12/07	2	3.9	1.95	Hassan Decl. 5:16-19
	Jaskol	9/20/06-9/29/06	2	11.2	5.8	Jaskol Decl. 5:17-19
	Jaskol	10/24/06-11/1/06	1	3.6	3.6	Jaskol Decl. 5:26-27
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelcon Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	118.49	
<i>Work on Merits of 2006 Appeal</i>	Albies	5/31/07-8/28/07	2	31.5	15.75	Albies Decl.4:14-16
	Eisenberg	3/26/07-4/26/07	1	22.7	22.7	Eisenberg Decl. 8:4-5
	Eisenberg	4/17/07-4/20/07	2	12	6	Eisenberg Decl. 8:10-11
	Eisenberg	4/27/07-7/5/07	2	177.1	88.5	Eisenberg Decl. 8:12-13
	Eisenberg	6/15/07-6/26/07	1	9.8	9.8	Eisenberg Decl. 8:14-15
	Eisenberg	7/2/07-8/16/07	1	121.1	121.1	Eisenberg Decl. 8:16-18
	Eisenberg	7/21/07-7/25/07	1	7.4	7.4	Eisenberg Decl. 8:19
	Eisenberg	8/4/07-8/6/07	1	6.5	6.5	Eisenberg Decl. 8:20

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Eisenberg	8/17/07-8/31/07	1	33.9	33.9	Eisenberg Decl. 8:21-22
	Eisenberg	8/16/07-8/31/07	1	6.6	6.6	Eisenberg Decl. 8:23-24
	Eisenberg	11/16/07-11/26/07	1	13.2	13.2	Eisenberg Decl. 8:28-9:1
	Goldberg	5/31/07-8/28/07	2	80.8	40.4	Goldberg Decl. 7:1-10
	Hancock	5/1/07-6/30/07	1	12.6	12.6	Hancock Decl. 4:14-16
	Hancock	7/1/07-9/30/07	1	41	41	Hancock Decl. 4:17-19
	Hancock	3/13/07-4/30/07	4	7.3	1.8	Hancock Decl. 4:12-13
	Hancock	10/1/07-12/31/07	1	4.3	4.3	Hancock Decl. 4:20-21
	Hassan	5/31/07-8/31/07	2	46.8	23.4	Hassan Decl. 5:20-28
	Jaskol	6/10/07-8/30/07	1	29	29	Jaskol Decl. 6:11-16
	Nelson	1/1/07-6/29/07	7	152.7	21.8	Nelson Decl. 9:1-9
	Nelson	7/1/07-12/14/07	6	48.1	8	Nelson Decl. 9:10-18
				TOTAL:	513.75	

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Plaintiffs 2007 Partial Summary Judgment</i>	Eisenberg	3/12/07-3/23/07	2	30.2	15.1	Eisenberg Decl.8:2-3
	Eisenberg	12/28/07-2/5/08	2	71.5	35.75	Eisenberg Decl. 9:4-5
	Hancock	3/13/07-4/30/07	4	7.3	1.8	Hancock Decl. 4:12-13
				TOTAL:	52.65	
<i>Opposition to USG Second Motion to Dismiss</i>	Albies	3/15/08-4/23/08	2	12.3	6.15	Albies Decl.4:20-22
	Eisenberg	2/11/08-3/31/08	1	87.5	87.5	Eisenberg Decl. 9:8-9
	Eisenberg	4/9/08-4/14/08	1	19.1	19.1	Eisenberg Decl. 9:10-11

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Eisenberg	4/15/08-4/24/08	1	29	29	Eisenberg Decl. 9:13-14
	Goldberg	2/7/08-4/23/08	2	83.3	41.65	Goldberg Decl. 7:16-22
	Hancock	1/1/08-5/31/08	4	14.3	3.57	Hancock Decl.3: 22-24
	Hassan	1/30/08-7/3/08	4	15.8	3.95	Hassan Decl. 6:4-10
	Jaskol	3/16/08-7/2/08	2	19.3	9.65	Jaskol Decl. 6:19-23
	Nelson	2/3/08-7/2/08	8	11.7	1.5	Nelson Decl. 9:19-24
				TOTAL:	202.07	
<i>Plaintiffs Amended Complaint</i>						
	Albies	7/3/08-7/21/08	3	3.6	1.2	Albies Decl.3:23-24
	Eisenberg	7/4/08-7/29/08	2	72.9	36.45	Eisenberg Decl. 9:17-18
	Goldberg	7/2/08-9/15/08	4	34.8	8.7	Goldberg Decl. 7:23-27

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Hancock	6/1/08-7/31/08	3	27.6	9.2	Hancock Decl. 4:25-27
	Hassan	11/17/06-3/22/07	8	12.3	1.54	Hassan Decl. 5:11-15
	Hassan	7/2/08-9/15/08	6	12.3	2.05	Hassan Decl. 6:11-15
	Jaskol	7/6/08-7/24/08	2	11.1	5.5	Jaskol Decl. 6:24-26
	Nelson	1/1/07-6/29/07	7	152.7	21.8	Nelson Decl. 9:1-9
	Nelson	7/3/08-12/15/08	3	22.3	7.4	Nelson Decl. 10:3-10
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	104.11	

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:	
<i>Opposition to Third USG Motion to Dismiss</i>	Albies	10/7/08-12/18/08	3	18.1	6	Albies Decl. 4:25-28	
	Eisenberg	11/16/08-12/9/08	3	27.1	9	Eisenberg Decl. 9:27-28	
	Eisenberg	9/30/08-10/23/08	2	90.6	45.3	Eisenberg Decl. 9:23-24	
	Goldberg	9/24/08-12/2/08	3	43.7	14.56	Goldberg Decl.8:1-4	
	Hancock	8/1/08-12/31/08	6	17.6	2.9	Hancock Decl. 5:1-5	
	Hassan	9/4/08-12/2/08	4	16	4	Hassan Decl. 6:16-20	
	Jaskol	10/3/08-1/7/09	2	8.1	4.05	Jaskol Decl. 7:8-10	
	Nelson	2/3/08-7/2/08	8	11.7	1.5	Nelson Decl. 9:19-24	
					TOTAL:	87.31	

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
Work on Plaintiffs 1806(f) Motion	Albies	10/7/08-12/18/08	3	18.1	6	Albies Decl. 4:25-28
	Eisenberg	8/26/08-9/30/08	2	70.7	35.35	Eisenberg Decl. 9:21-22
	Eisenberg	10/23/08-11/14/08	2	51	25.5	Eisenberg Decl. 9:25-26
	Goldberg	11/18/07-1/29/08	4	12.4	3.1	Goldberg Decl. 7:12-15
	Goldberg	9/24/08-12/2/08	3	43.7	14.56	Goldberg Decl.8:1-4
	Hancock	8/1/08-12/31/08	6	17.6	2.9	Hancock Decl. 5:1-5
	Hassan	9/1/07-1/29/08	4	26.2	6.55	Hassan Decl. 6:1-3
	Hassan	9/4/08-12/2/08	4	16	4	Hassan Decl. 6:16-20
	Jaskol	9/4/08-11/3/08	2	3.1	1.55	Jaskol Decl. 7:5-6
	Nelson	2/3/08-7/2/08	8	11.7	1.5	Nelson Decl. 9:19-24
	Nelson	7/3/08-12/15/08	3	22.3	7.4	Nelson Decl.10:3-10

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
				TOTAL:	108.41	
<i>Work on USG Appeal in Jan. 2009 1292(b), Stay Pending Appeal, Ninth Circuit Work</i>	Eisenberg	1/17/09-2/23/09	2	53.5	26.75	Eisenberg Decl. 10:7-8
	Eisenberg	1/26/09-2/6/09	2	32.5	16.25	Eisenberg Decl. 10:9-10
	Eisenberg	2/12/09-2/13/09	2	11.6	5.8	Eisenberg Decl. 10:13-15
	Eisenberg	2/23/09-2/26/09	1	17.5	17.5	Eisenberg Decl. 10:16-17
	Eisenberg	2/27/2009	1	1	1	Eisenberg Decl. 10:18-19
	Goldberg	1/28/09-2/25/09	2	21.4	10.7	Goldberg Decl. 8:12-15
	Hancock	1/1/09-3/31/09	1	10.7	10.7	Hancock Decl. 5:6-8
	Jaskol	1/17/09-2/26/09	2	4.6	2.3	Jaskol Decl. 7:11-13

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	101.27	
Work Proposed Protective Order	Eisenberg	4/20/09-5/15/09	2	29.4	14.7	Eisenberg Decl. 11:2-4
	Goldberg	3/2/09-6/3/09	4	32.4	8.1	Goldberg Decl. 8:16-23
	Jaskol	4/21/09-4/23/09	1	3	3	Jaskol Decl. 7:17
	Jaskol	5/15/2009	1	1	1.7	Jaskol Decl. 7:18-20
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	37.77	

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Work on Order to Show Cause re: Protective Order Sanctions</i>	Albies	1/5/09-6/5/09	6	33.2	5.5	Albies Decl. 5:1-5
	Eisenberg	5/25/09-5/31/09	2	39.7	19.85	Eisenberg Decl. 11: 7-10
	Eisenberg	6/1/09-6/3/09	1	15.9	15.9	Eisenberg Decl. 11:11-12
	Goldberg	3/2/09-6/3/09	4	32.4	8.1	Goldberg Decl. 8:16-23
	Hancock	4/1/09-6/30/09	5	30.9	6.2	Hancock Decl. 4:9-15
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	65.82	

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Work on Plaintiffs 2009 Partial Summary Judgment Motion</i>	Albies	6/11/09-9/23/09	2	21.5	10.75	Albies Decl. 4:6-10
	Eisenberg	6/4/09-7/9/09	2	63.9	31.95	Eisenberg Decl. 10:13-14
	Eisenberg	7/13/09-9/9/09	2	82.2	41.1	Eisenberg Decl. 10:16-18
	Eisenberg	7/10/09-7/12/09	1	7	7	Eisenberg Decl. 11:15
	Eisenberg	9/17/09-9/23/09	1	23.5	23.5	Eisenberg Decl. 11:25-26
	Goldberg	6/16/09-9/23/09	3	35.8	11.9	Goldberg Decl. 8:25-28
	Hancock	7/1/09-12/31/09	3	6.8	2.26	Hancock Decl. 4:16-18
	Hassan	5/27/09-3/30/10	2	10.4	5.2	Hassan Decl. 6:23-27
	Jaskol	5/27/09-4/13/10	2	14	7	Jaskol Decl. 7:23-25
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	150.93	

v.
Obama
Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
SUMMARY						
Timekeeper:	2006 / (25%)	2007 / (25%)	2008 / (25%)	2009 / (25%)	2010	TOTAL
Albies	141.56 / (35.4)	x	19.35 / (4.83)	16.25 / (4.1)	x	177.16 / (44.33)
Eisenberg	262.6 / (65.65)	366.1 / (91.52)	341.05 / (85.26)	190.8 / (47.7)	x	1160.55 / (290.13)
Goldberg	114.61 / (28.65)	43.8 / (10.95)	82.57 / (20.64)	38.8 / (9.7)	x	279.78 / (69.94)
Hancock	1.14 / (.28)	63.75 / (15.93)	18.57 / (4.64)	19.16 / (4.79)	x	102.62 / (25.64)
Hassan	62.27 / (15.57)	28.43 / (7.1)	20.55 / (5.13)	5.2 / (1.3)	x	116.45 / (29.1)
Jaskol	71.06 / (17.76)	29 / (7.25)	20.75 / (5.16)	14 / (3.5)	x	134.81 / (33.67)
Nelson	260.92 / (65.23)	51.6 / (12.5)	19.3 / (4.82)	51.35 / (12.83)	x	383.17 / (95.38)
TOTAL:	914.16 / (228.54)	582.68 / (145.25)	522.14 / (130.48)	335.56 / (83.92)	x	2354.54 / (588.19)

Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorney Fees

Al-Haramain Islamic Found. Oregon et al. v. Obama et al.
(07-cv-109-VRW) (3:06-md-1791-VRW)

HEARING ATTENDANCE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)
INC., et al.)
)
Plaintiffs,) CV No. 06-274-KI
)
vs.) April 25, 2006
)
GEORGE W. BUSH, et al,) Portland, Oregon
)
Defendants.)

TRANSCRIPT OF TELEPHONIC CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: J. Ashlee Albise
Zaha S. Hassan
Thomas H. Nelson
Steven Goldberg
Lisa R. Jaskol

FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Anthony J. Coppolino
Andrea Marie Gacki
James L. Sutherland

FOR OREGON PUBLISHING: Charles F. Hinkle

COURT REPORTER: Dennis R. Grube
1000 S.W. Third Ave, Rm. 301
Portland, OR 97204
(503) 326-8180

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)	
INC., an Oregon nonprofit)	
corporation, et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	No. CV-06-274-KI
)	
vs.)	June 19, 2006
)	
GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the)	Portland, Oregon
United States, et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

TELEPHONE CONFERENCE

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 S. W. Morrison
Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 Broadway
Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of J. Ashlee Albies
621 S.W. Alder Street
Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

1 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Zaha S. Hassan
2 Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
3 825 N.E. Multnomah Street
Suite 925
Portland, OR 97232-2150

4 Lisa R. Jaskol
5 Attorney at Law
6 15760 Ventura Boulevard
18th Floor
Encino, CA 91436

7 FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Andrea Marie Gacki
8 U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
9 Room 7334
Washington, DC 20001

10 Andrew H. Tannenbaum
11 U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
12 P. O. Box 883
Washington, DC 20044

13 James L. Sutherland
14 Assistant United States Attorney
U.S. Attorney's Office
15 1000 S.W. Third Avenue
Suite 600
16 Portland, OR 97204

17 Carl Nichols

18 COURT REPORTER: Nancy M. Walker, CSR, RMR, CRR
19 United States District Courthouse
20 1000 S. W. Third Avenue, Room 301
Portland, OR 97204
(503) 326-8186

21 Proceedings recorded stenographically,
22 computer-aided transcription
23
24
25

062706king

1

1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON
3 AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)
4 INC., an Oregon nonprofit)
corporation, et al.,)
5 Plaintiffs,) No. CV-06-274-KI
6 vs.) June 27, 2006
7 GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the) Portland, Oregon
8 United States, et al.,)
9 Defendants.)

10

11 TELEPHONE CONFERENCE
12 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
13 BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING
14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

15

16

APPEARANCES

17

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 S. W. Morrison
Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

18

19

20

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 Broadway
Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

21

22

23

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of J. Ashlee Albies
621 S.W. Alder Street
Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

24

25

♀

2

1 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Thomas H. Nelson
Zaha S. Hassan
Page 1

2 062706king
Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
825 N.E. Multnomah Street
3 Suite 925
Portland, OR 97232-2150

4
5 Lisa R. Jasko1
Attorney at Law
15760 Ventura Boulevard
6 18th Floor
Encino, CA 91436

7
8 FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Anthony J. Coppolino
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
9 Room 6102
Washington, DC 20530

10
11 Andrea Marie Gacki
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
12 Room 7334
Washington, DC 20001

13
14 Andrew H. Tannenbaum
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
15 P. O. Box 883
Washington, DC 20044

16
17 James L. Sutherland
Assistant United States Attorney
U.S. Attorney's Office
18 1000 S.W. Third Avenue
Suite 600
19 Portland, OR 97204

20 COURT REPORTER: Nancy M. Walker, CSR, RMR, CRR
United States District Courthouse
21 1000 S. W. Third Avenue, Room 301
Portland, OR 97204
22 (503) 326-8186

23 Proceedings recorded stenographically,
24 computer-aided transcription

♀

3

1 P R O C E E D I N G S
2 THE CLERK: Good afternoon, Counsel.
3 Mr. Sutherland?
4 MR. SUTHERLAND: Yes.
5 THE CLERK: Mr. Nelson?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)
INC., an Oregon nonprofit)
corporation, et al.,)

Plaintiffs,)

vs.)

GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the)
United States, et al.,)

Defendants.)

No. CV-06-274-KI

August 29, 2006

Portland, Oregon

MOTION HEARING

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:

Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 S. W. Morrison
Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 Broadway
Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of J. Ashlee Albies
621 S.W. Alder Street
Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

Thomas H. Nelson
Zaha S. Hassan
Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
825 N.E. Multnomah Street
Suite 925
Portland, OR 97232-2150

Lisa R. Jaskol
Attorney at Law
15760 Ventura Boulevard
18th Floor
Encino, CA 91436

FOR THE DEFENDANTS:

Anthony J. Coppolino
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 6102
Washington, DC 20530

Andrea Marie Gacki
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 7334
Washington, DC 20001

Andrew H. Tannenbaum
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
P. O. Box 883
Washington, DC 20044

1 COURT REPORTER: Nancy M. Walker, CSR, RMR, CRR
2 United States District Courthouse
3 1000 S. W. Third Avenue, Room 301
4 Portland, OR 97204
5 (503) 326-8186

6 Proceedings recorded stenographically,
7 computer-aided transcription
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)
INC., an Oregon nonprofit)
corporation, et al.,)

Plaintiffs,)No. CV-06-274-KI

v)November 1, 2006

GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the)Portland, Oregon
United States, et al.,)

Defendants,)

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING,
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 SW Morrison, Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 SW Broadway, Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of Jessica Ashlee Albies
621 SW Alder Street, Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Zaha S. Hassan
Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
825 NE Multnomah St. Suite 925
Portland, OR 97232

Lisa R. Jaskol
Attorney at Law
15760 Ventura Blvd, 18th Floor
Encino, CA 91436

FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Andrea Marie Gacki
US Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Ave, NW, Room 7334
Washington, DC 20001

Andrew H. Tannenbaum
US Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Ave, NW
PO Box 883
Washington, DC 20044

Anthony J. Coppolino
US Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Ave, NW Room 6102
Washington, DC 20530

James L. Sutherland
Assistant US Attorney
US Attorney's Office
1000 SW Third Ave, Suite 600
Portland, OR 97204

* * * * *

KAREN M. EICHHORN, CSR, CM
Certified Shorthand Reporter
8502 SW 43rd Ave.
Portland, Oregon 97219
503-936-4805

Transcript 120208 PM AHIF

Pages 1 - 64

United States District Court
Northern District of California
Before The Honorable Vaughn R. Walker

In re: NSA
Telecommunications Records
Litigation

MDL No. 06-1791 VRW

Related To

C07-0109 VRW

San Francisco, California
Tuesday, December 2, 2008

Reporter's Transcript Of Proceedings

Appearances:

For Plaintiff:

Eisenberg And Hancock, LLP
1970 Broadway, Suite 1200
Oakland, California 94612
By: Jon B. Eisenberg, Esquire
William Hancock, Esquire

Stenson, Schumann, Tewksbury
Creighton & Rose
815 S.W. Second Avenue, Suite 500
Portland, Oregon 97204
By: Ashlee Albies, Esquire

Law Office of Steven Goldberg
River Park Center, Suite 300
205 S.E. Spokane Street
Portland, Oregon 97202
By: Steven Goldberg, Esquire

(Appearances continued on next page.)

Reported By:

Sahar McVickar, RPR, CSR No. 12963
Official Reporter, U.S. District Court
For the Northern District of California

0

2

1 Appearances, continued:

2 For Defendant: United States Department of Justice
3 Federal Programs Branch
Civil Division

Transcript 120208 PM AHIF
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20530
By: Anthony Coppolino, Esquire
Carl J. Nichols, Esquire
Alex Haas, Esquire
Tim

4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0

3

1 Tuesday, December 2, 2008 2:00 p.m.

2 P R O C E E D I N G S

3 THE CLERK: Calling MDL 06-1791, In re: NSA
4 Telecommunications Records Litigation.

5 This hearing this afternoon is related to case No.
6 07-0109, Al-Haramain Foundation versus George Bush, et al.

7 Appearances, Counsel.

8 MR. EISENBERG: Jon B. Eisenberg.
Page 2

Volume 1

Pages 1 - 42

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

BEFORE THE HONORABLE VAUGHN R. WALKER

In Re National Security Agency)	MDL 06-1791-VRW
Telecommunications Records)	
Litigation)	
Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation,)	
Inc., et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	
)	
vs.)	NO. C 07-0109-VRW
)	
George W. Bush, et al.,)	
)	San Francisco, California
Defendants.)	Friday
)	January 23, 2009
)	10:30 a.m.

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

APPEARANCES:

For Plaintiffs	Eisenberg & Hancock
Al-Haramain Islamic	1970 Broadway, Suite 1200
Foundation, Inc.;	Oakland, CA 94612
Asim Ghafoor;	(510) 452-2581
Wendell Belew:	(510) 452-3277 (fax)

BY: JON B. EISENBEG
WILLIAM N. HANCOCK

For Plaintiffs:	Steven Goldberg
Al-Haramain Islamic	Attorney at Law
Foundation, Inc.;	River Park Center, Suite 300
Asim Ghafoor;	205 SE Spokane Street
Wendell Belew:	Portland, OR 97202

BY: STEVEN GOLDBERG

(Appearances Continued On Next Page)

Reported By: Lydia Zinn, CSR #9223, RPR
Official Reporter - U.S. District Court

1 APPEARANCES (CONT'D)

2 **For MDL Plaintiffs:** Electronic Frontier Foundation
3 454 Shotwell Street
4 San Francisco, CA 94110
5 (415) 436-9333 x 108

6 **BY: CINDY ANN COHN**

7 **For Defendants** U.S. Department of Justice
8 **FBI; NSA; OFAC;** Civil Division
9 **President Barack Obama;** 20 Massachusetts Ave., N.W., Room 6102
10 **Keith B. Alexander;** Washington, D.C. 20530
11 **Robert S. Mueller,** (202) 514-4652
12 **III; Adam Szubin;** Washington, D.C. 20530
13 **Alexander K. Haas:** **BY: ANTHONY JOSPEH COPPOLINO**

14 **For Defendants** U.S. Department of Justice
15 **FBI; NSA; OFAC;** Federal Programs Branch
16 **President Barack Obama;** 20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.
17 **Keith B. Alexander;** Washington, D.C. 20001
18 **Robert S. Mueller,** (202) 307-3937
19 **Adam Szubin:** **BY: ALEXANDER KENNETH HAAS**

20 **For Defendant** National Security Agency
21 **National Security** Fort George G. Meade MD 20755
22 **Agency:** **BY: TIMOTHY STINSON**

23
24
25

United States District Court
Northern District of California

Before The Honorable Vaughn R. Walker

In re: National Security)
Agency Telecommunications)
Records Litigation,)
)
)
)
)
)
)

No. C06-1791 VRW

San Francisco, California
Wednesday, June 3, 2009

Reporter's Transcript Of Proceedings

Appearances:

For Plaintiff: Eisenberg And Hancock, LLP
1970 Broadway, Suite 1200
Oakland, California 94612
By: Jon B. Eisenberg, Esquire
William Hancock, Esquire

Steenon Schumann Tewksbury
Creighton and Rose, PC
500 Yamhill Plaza
815 S.W. Second Avenue
Portland, Oregon 97204
By: J. Ashlee Albies, Esquire

Also Present:
at Plaintiff
Counsel Table: Alan Kabot
(Interested Party)

(Appearances continued on next page.)

Reported By: Sahar McVickar, RPR, CSR No. 12963
Official Reporter, U.S. District Court
For the Northern District of California

(Computerized Transcription By Eclipse)

1 Appearances, continued:

2 For Plaintiff: Law Office of Steven Goldberg
205 S.E. Spokane Street, Suite 300
3 Portland, Oregon 97202

4 By: Steven Goldberg, Esquire
(Telephonically)

5 Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
P.O. Box 1211
6 Welches, Oregon 97067

7 By: Thomas H. Nelson, Esquire

8 For Defendant: United States Department of Justice
Civil Division
20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Rm. 7344
9 Washington, DC 20530

10 By: Anthony Joseph Coppolino, Esquire

11 Office of the General Counsel
National Security Agency
9800 Savage Road
12 Ft. George Meade, Maryland 20755

13 By: Timothy Stinson, Esquire

14 ---o0o---

PAGES 1 - 58

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

BEFORE THE HONORABLE VAUGHN R. WALKER, JUDGE

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC)
FOUNDATION, ET AL.,)
)
 PLAINTIFFS,)
)
 VS.)
)
 GEORGE W. BUSH, ET AL.,)
)
 DEFENDANTS.)
)

NO. C 07-109 VRW

SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 2009

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

APPEARANCES :

FOR PLAINTIFF:

EISENBERG & HANCOCK
1970 BROADWAY
SUITE 1200
OAKLAND, CA 94612

BY: JON B. EISENBERG
THOMAS HANCOCK
ATTORNEYS AT LAW

STEVEN GOLDBERG
ATTORNEY AT LAW
205 S.E. SPOKANE ST.
SUITE 300
PORTLAND, OREGON 97202

(APPEARANCES CONTINUED ON FOLLOWING PAGE)

REPORTED BY:

JAMES YEOMANS, CSR #4039, RPR
OFFICIAL REPORTER

COMPUTERIZED TRANSCRIPTION BY ECLIPSE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES: (CONTINUED)

FOR PLAINTIFF: THOMAS HOWARD NELSON
 ATTORNEY AT LAW
 24525 E. WELCHES ROAD
 WELCHES, OREGON 97067

FOR DEFENDANT: U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
 CIVIL DIVISION
 20 MASSACHUSETTS AVENUE, N.W.
 ROOM 6102
 WASHINGTON, DC 20530
BY: ANTHONY JOSEPH COPPOLINO
 TIMOTHY STINSON
 ATTORNEYS AT LAW