

Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorney Fees

Al-Haramain Islamic Found. Oregon et al. v. Obama et al.
(07-cv-109-VRW) (3:06-md-1791-VRW)

Appendix 4

CONSULTATION HOURS BY ATTORNEY

Appendix 4 - Consultation Hours by Counsel

The following spreadsheet lists the number of times that plaintiffs' counsel indicated that they consulted with co-counsel, sets forth number of hours contained in the blocks containing these references, and calculates 25% of the total time for these blocks as a reduction for excessive consultations.

Note: Page references in the chart are to the page numbers indicated in the ECF generated header at the **top** of the declaration cited.

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Albies	2/5/06 - 2/27/06	18.3	4.58	Albies Decl. pg 3:10-11	
Albies	3/2/06 - 4/17/06	54.8	13.7	Albies Decl. pg 3:13-15	
Albies	4/18/06 - 4/23/06	33.5	8.38	Albies Decl. pg 3:16-18	
Albies	5/1/06 - 5/23/06	32.7	8.18	Albies Decl. pg 3:19-21	
Albies	5/16/06 - 8/29/06	52.5	13.13	Albies Decl. pg 3:22-24	
Albies	8/18/06 - 9/25/06	5.6	1.4	Albies Decl. pg 4:1-3	
Albies	9/25/06 - 10/24/06	27.9	6.98	Albies Decl. pg 4:4-5	
Albies	10/23/06 -11/1/06	30.5	7.63	Albies Decl. pg 4:6-8	
Albies	11/7/06 - 12/5/06	48.2	12.05	Albies Decl. pg 4:9-10	2006 = 76.03
Albies	1/7/07 - 4/19/07	5.7	1.43	Albies Decl. pg 4:12-13	
Albies	5/31/07 -8/28/07	31.5	7.88	Albies Decl. pg 4:14-16	2007=9.31
Albies	11/28/07 - 2/11/08	11.7	2.93	Albies Decl. pg 4:17-19	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Albies	3/15/08 - 4/23/08	12.3	3.08	Albies Decl. pg 4:20-22	
Albies	7/3/08 - 7/21/08	3.6	0.9	Albies Decl. pg 4:23-24	
Albies	10/7/08 - 12/18/08	18.1	4.53	Albies Decl. pg 4:25-28	2008= 11.44
Albies	1/5/09 - 6/5/09	33.2	8.3	Albies Decl. pg 5:1-5	
Albies	6/11/09 - 9/23/09	21.5	5.38	Albies Decl. pg 5:6-10	2009= 13.68
Albies	3/31/10 - 5/5/10	11.9	2.98	Albies Decl. pg 5:11-13	2010= 2.98
ALBIES TOTAL:	113.44				
Eisenberg	2/27/06	1	0.25	Eisenberg Decl. pg 5:14-15	
Eisenberg	3/2/06 - 3/7/06	1.7	0.43	Eisenberg Decl. pg 5:16-17	
Eisenberg	3/6/06 - 3/15/06	11.5	2.88	Eisenberg Decl. pg 5:18-19	
Eisenberg	3/18/06 - 4/14/06	26.5	6.63	Eisenberg Decl. pg 5:20-22	
Eisenberg	4/18/06 - 5/22/06	70	17.5	Eisenberg Decl. pg 5:23-24	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Eisenberg	5/3/06 - 5/21/06	9.7	2.43	Eisenberg Decl. pg 5:25-26	
Eisenberg	5/17/06 - 5/22/06	7.2	1.8	Eisenberg Decl. pg 5:27-28	
Eisenberg	5/25/06 - 6/16/06	55.7	13.93	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:3-4	
Eisenberg	6/12/06 - 7/4/06	66.5	16.63	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:6-7	
Eisenberg	6/20/06 - 6/27/06	45.7	11.43	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:8-9	
Eisenberg	7/10/06 - 7/31/06	10.9	2.73	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:10-11	
Eisenberg	8/10/06 - 8/15/06	5	1.25	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:12-14	
Eisenberg	8/18/06	2	0.5	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:17-19	
Eisenberg	8/30/06 - 10/31/06	71.2	17.8	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:20-21	
Eisenberg	9/20/06 - 11/1/06	44.3	11.8	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:23-24	
Eisenberg	10/31/06 - 11/3/06	7.7	1.93	Eisenberg Decl. pg 6:26-7:1	
Eisenberg	11/15/06 - 11/20/06	8.8	2.2	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:6-7	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Eisenberg	11/14/06 - 1/24/07	8	2	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:8-9	
Eisenberg	11/26/06 - 1/4/07	9.1	2.28	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:11-14	
Eisenberg	12/10/06 - 1/30/07	33.6	8.4	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:15-16	
Eisenberg	12/19/06 - 12/22/06	4.5	1.13	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:17-18	
Eisenberg	12/26/06 - 1/9/07	5.1	1.28	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:19-20	2006 = 127.21
Eisenberg	1/10/07	0.6	0.15	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:21-22	
Eisenberg	1/15/07 - 8/8/07	12.1	2.57	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:23-25	
Eisenberg	2/1/07 - 2/19/07	21.3	5.33	Eisenberg Decl. pg 7:26-27	
Eisenberg	3/12/07 - 3/23/07	30.2	7.55	Eisenberg Decl. pg 8:2-3	
Eisenberg	4/17/07 - 4/20/07	12	3	Eisenberg Decl. pg 8:10-11	
Eisenberg	4/27/07 - 7/5/07	177.1	44.28	Eisenberg Decl. pg 8:12-13	
Eisenberg	7/2/07 - 8/16/07	121.1	30.28	Eisenberg Decl. pg 8:16-18	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Eisenberg	9/2/07- 11/5/07	30.1	7.53	Eisenberg Decl. pg 8:25-27	
Eisenberg	11/16/07- 11/26/07	6.6	1.65	Eisenberg Decl. pg 8:28-9:1	2007 = 102.34
Eisenberg	11/20/07 - 6/24/08	62.1	15.53	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:2-3	
Eisenberg	12/28/07 - 2/5/08	71.5	17.88	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:4-5	
Eisenberg	2/7/08	5.5	1.38	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:6-7	
Eisenberg	7/2/08 - 7/3/08	8.5	2.13	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:15-16	
Eisenberg	7/4/08 - 7/9/08	72.9	18.23	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:17- 18	
Eisenberg	8/26/08 - 9/30/08	70.7	17.68	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:21-22	
Eisenberg	9/30/08 - 10/23/08	90.6	22.65	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:23-24	
Eisenberg	10/23/08 - 11/14/08	51	12.75	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:25-26	
Eisenberg	11/16/08 - 12/9/08	27.1	6.78	Eisenberg Decl. pg 9:27-28	2008 = 115.01
Eisenberg	1/5/09 - 1/6/09	7.7	1.93	Eisenberg Decl. pg 10:1-2	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Eisenberg	1/12/09 - 1/20/09	15.8	3.95	Eisenberg Decl. pg 10:4-5	
Eisenberg	11/17/09- 2/23/09	53.5	13.3	Eisenberg Decl. pg 10:7-8	
Eisenberg	1/26/09 - 2/6/09	32.5	8.13	Eisenberg Decl. pg 10:9-10	
Eisenberg	2/12/09 - 2/13/09	11.6	2.9	Eisenberg Decl. pg 10:13-15	
Eisenberg	2/28/09-3/2/09	11.5	2.88	Eisenberg Decl. pg 10:20-22	
Eisenberg	4/16/09 - 4/22/09	22.4	5.6	Eisenberg Decl. pg 10:26-11:1	
Eisenberg	4/20/09 - 5/15/09	29.4	7.35	Eisenberg Decl. pg 11:2-4	
Eisenberg	5/25/09 - 5/31/09	39.7	9.93	Eisenberg Decl. pg 11:7-10	
Eisenberg	6/4/09 - 7/9/09	63.9	15.98	Eisenberg Decl. pg 11:13-14	
Eisenberg	7/13/09 - 9/9/09	82.3	20.58	Eisenberg Decl. pg 11:16-18	
Eisenberg	7/29/09 - 7/31/09	1.2	0.3	Eisenberg Decl. pg 11:21-22	
Eisenberg	11/9/09-11/11/09	17.5	4.38	Eisenberg Decl. pg 12:10-11	2009 = 97.21

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Eisenberg	3/31/10	1.5	0.38	Eisenberg Decl. pg 12:19-20	
Eisenberg	3/31/10 - 4/5/10	10	2.5	Eisenberg Decl. pg 12:21-23	
Eisenberg	4/7/10 - 4/9/10	14.7	3.68	Eisenberg Decl. pg 12:24-26	
Eisenberg	4/12/10 - 4/16/10	18.2	4.55	Eisenberg Decl. pg 12:27-28	
Eisenberg	4/19/10 - 5/7/10	4.7	1.18	Eisenberg Decl. pg 13:1-3	
Eisenberg	4/20/10 - 5/7/10	62	15.5	Eisenberg Decl. pg 13:4-5	
Eisenberg	5/1/10	4.8	1.2	Eisenberg Decl. pg 13:6-7	
Eisenberg	6/4/10 - 6/8/10	12.7	3.18	Eisenberg Decl. pg 13:11-12	
Eisenberg	6/9/10 - 7/6/10	43.9	10.98	Eisenberg Decl. pg 13:13-14	2010 = 43.15
EISENBERG TOTAL:	484.92				
Goldberg	12/6/05 - 2/28/06	12.2	3.05	Goldberg Decl. pg 5:2	
Goldberg	2/28/06 - 12/20/06	3.4	0.85	Goldberg Decl. pg 5:4-5	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Goldberg	3/17/06 - 5/25/06	34	8.5	Goldberg Decl. pg 5:7-9	
Goldberg	3/17/06 - 5/25/06	15.5	3.88	Goldberg Decl. pg 5:10-14	
Goldberg	3/17/06 - 5/25/06	11	2.75	Goldberg Decl. pg 5:21-22	
Goldberg	5/28/06 - 6/7/06	18	4.5	Goldberg Decl. pg 5:24-27	
Goldberg	6/21/06 - 10/28/06	22.5	5.63	Goldberg Decl. pg 6:1-3	
Goldberg	7/1/06 - 8/29/06	23	5.75	Goldberg Decl. pg 6:9-13	
Goldberg	10/23/06 - 11/1/06	22	5.5	Goldber Decl. pg 6:14-19	2006 = 40.41
Goldberg	11/22/06 - 5/7/07	6.2	1.55	Goldberg Decl. pg 6:20-22	
Goldberg	5/31/07 - 8/28/07	80.8	20.2	Goldberg Decl. pg 7:1-10	
Goldberg	11/18/07 - 1/29/08	12.4	3.1	Goldberg Decl. pg 7:12-15	2007 = 24.85
Goldberg	2/7/08 - 4/23/08	83.3	20.825	Goldberg Decl. pg 7:16-22	
Goldberg	7/2/08 - 9/15/08	34.8	8.7	Goldberg Decl. pg 7:23-27	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Goldberg	9/24/08 - 12/2/08	43.7	10.9	Goldberg Decl. pg 8:1-4	2008 = 40.42
Goldberg	1/5/09 - 1/23/09	23.3	5.83	Goldberg Decl. pg 8:6-10	
Goldberg	1/28/09 - 2/25/09	21.4	5.35	Goldberg Decl. pg 8:11-15	
Goldberg	3/2/09 - 6/3/09	32.4	8.1	Goldberg Decl. pg 8:16-23	
Goldberg	6/16/09 - 9/23/09	35.8	8.95	Goldberg Decl. pg 8:24-27	2009 = 28.23
Goldberg	3/31/10 - 5/24/10	55.6	13.9	Goldberg Decl. pg 9:1-7	
Goldberg	6/7/10 - 6/25/10	32.5	8.13	Goldberg Decl. pg 9:9-13	2010 = 22.03
GOLDBERG TOTAL:	155.945				
Hancock	8/1/08- 12/31/08	17.6	4.4	Hancock Decl. pg 4:28-5:5	2008 = 4.4
Hancock	4/1/09 - 6/30/09	30.9	7.73	Hancock Decl. pg 5:9-15	2009 = 7.73
Hancock	1/1/10-4/30/10	27	6.75	Hancock Decl. pg 5:19-23	2010 = 6.75
HANCOCK TOTAL:	18.88				

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Hassan	2/19/06 - 2/28/06	10.6	2.65	Hassan Decl. pg 3:26-27	
Hassan	3/17/06 - 5/25/06	21.5	5.38	Hassan Decl. pg 4:1-6	
Hassan	3/17/06 - 5/25/06	46.1	11.53	Hassan Decl. pg 4:7-13	
Hassan	5/28/06 - 6/7/06	7.1	1.78	Hassan Decl. pg 4:14-16	
Hassan	6/22/06 - 9/18/06	13.4	3.35	Hassan Decl. pg 4:17-21	
Hassan	7/1/06 - 8/29/06	21	5.25	Hassan Decl. pg 4:22-25	
Hassan	5/26/06 - 6/28/06	5.4	1.35	Hassan Decl. pg 4:26-27	
Hassan	9/7/06 - 11/1/06	18.6	4.65	Hassan Decl. pg 5:1-6	
Hassan	9/7/06 - 11/17/06	12.7	3.18	Hassan Decl. pg 5:7-9	2006 = 39.12
Hassan	11/17/06 - 3/22/07	12.3	3.08	Hassan Decl. pg 5:11-15	
Hassan	3/24/07 - 4/12/07	3.9	0.98	Hassan Decl. pg 5:16-19	
Hassan	5/31/07 - 8/31/07	46.8	11.7	Hassan Decl. pg 5:20-27	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Hassan	9/1/07 - 1/29/08	26.2	6.55	Hassan Decl. pg 6:1-3	2007 = 22.31
Hassan	1/30/08 - 7/3/08	15.8	3.95	Hassan Decl. pg 6:4-10	0
Hassan	7/2/08 - 9/15/08	12.3	3.08	Hassan Decl. pg 6:11-15	
Hassan	9/4/08 - 12/2/08	16	4	Hassan Decl. pg 6:16-20	2008 = 11.03
Hassan	12/3/08 - 1/22/09	6.9	1.73	Hassan Decl. pg 6:21-22	
Hassan	5/27/09 - 3/30/10	10.4	2.6	Hassan Decl. pg 6:23-27	2009 = 4.33
Hassan	3/31/10 - 5/21/10	23	5.75	Hassan Decl. pg 7:1-7	
Hassan	6/4/10 - 6/29/10	13.5	3.38	Hassan Decl. pg 7:9-12	2010 = 9.13
HASSAN TOTAL:	85.92				
Jaskol	3/7/06 - 3/16/06	16.5	4.13	Jaskol Decl. pg 4:19-20	
Jaskol	3/17/06 - 6/19/06	32.9	8.23	Jaskol Decl. pg 4:22-25	
Jaskol	5/17/06 - 9/14/06	7.3	1.83	Jaskol Decl. pg 5:1-3	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Jaskol	6/2/06 -9/5/06	9.9	2.48	Jaskol Decl. pg 5:5-8	
Jaskol	6/6/06 - 9/7/06	26.3	6.58	Jaskol Decl. pg 5:10-13	
Jaskol	6/29/06 - 7/26/06	6.8	1.7	Jaskol Decl. pg 5:15-16	
Jaskol	9/20/06 - 9/29/06	11.2	2.8	Jaskol Decl. pg 5:17-19	
Jaskol	10/23/06 - 10/27/06	5.6	1.4	Jaskol Decl. pg 5:23-25	
Jaskol	11/1/06 - 11/3/06	1.5	0.38	Jaskol Decl. pg 6:1-3	
Jaskol	12/20/06 - 12/27/06	2.3	0.58	Jaskol Decl. pg 6:8-9	2006 = 30.11
Jaskol	3/16/08 - 7/2/08	15.7	3.93	Jaskol Decl. pg 6:20-21	
Jaskol	4/9/08 - 4/11/08	3.6	0.9	Jaskol Decl. pg 6:22-23	
Jaskol	7/6/08 - 7/24/08	11.1	2.78	Jaskol Decl. pg 6:24-25	
Jaskol	2/6/08 - 2/17/09	3.1	0.78	Jaskol Decl. pg 7:1-3	
Jaskol	9/4/08 - 11/3/08	7.7	1.93	Jaskol Decl. pg 7:5-6	

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Jaskol	10/3/08 - 1/7/09	8.1	2.03	Jaskol Decl. pg 7:7-9	2008 = 12.35
Jaskol	1/17/09 - 2/26/09	4.6	1.15	Jaskol Decl. pg 7:11-13	
Jaskol	5/25/09 - 5/27/09	2	0.5	Jaskol Decl. pg 7:21-22	
Jaskol	5/27/09 - 4/13/09	14	3.5	Jaskol Decl. pg 7:23-24	2009 = 5.15
JASKOL TOTAL:	47.61				
Nelson	3/1/06 - 12/20/06	65.6	16.4	Nelson Decl. pg 7:13-19	
Nelson	3/25/06 - 5/1/06	112.1	28.03	Nelson Decl. pg 7:20-8:1	
Nelson	9/25/06 - 12/21/06	73	18.25	Nelson Decl. pg 8:16-22	2006 = 62.68
Nelson	1/1/07 - 6/29/07	152.7	38.18	Nelson Decl. pg 9:1-9	
Nelson	7/1/07 - 12/14/07	48.1	12.03	Nelson Decl. pg 9:10-18	2007 = 50.21
Nelson	2/3/08 - 7/2/08	11.7	2.93	Nelson Decl. pg 9:19-24	
Nelson	7/3/08 - 12/15/08	22.3	5.58	Nelson Decl. pg 10:3- 11	2008 = 8.51

v.

Obama

Fee Application - Consultation Hours

Timekeeper:	Date(s):	Total Hours in Block:	Total Consult Hours Assuming 25%	Declaration Citation:	Annual Total
Nelson	1/09 - present	113	28.25	Nelson Decl. pg 10:12-24	2009 = 28.25
NELSON TOTAL:	149.65				

**TOTAL BLOCK
HOURS (2006-2010): 4177.4**

TIMEKEEPER	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	TOTAL
ALBIES:	76.03	9.31	11.44	13.68	2.98	113.44
EISENBERG:	127.21	102.34	115.01	97.21	43.15	484.92
GOLDBERG:	40.41	24.85	40.42	28.23	22.03	155.94
HANCOCK :	x	x	4.40	7.73	6.75	18.88
HASSAN:	39.12	22.31	11.03	4.33	9.13	85.92
JASKOL :	30.11	x	12.35	5.15	x	47.61
NELSON :	62.68	50.21	8.51	28.25	x	149.65
TOTAL:	375.56	209.02	203.19	184.58	84.04	1056.36