

U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:14-cv-00372-RDM

DOE v. FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF
ETHIOPIA
Assigned to: Judge Randolph D. Moss
Cause: 28:1602 Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act

Date Filed: 03/05/2014
Date Terminated: 05/25/2016
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 890 Other Statutory
Actions
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

JOHN DOE
also known as
KIDANE

represented by **Nathan Daniel Cardozo**
ELECTRONIC FRONTIER
FOUNDATION
815 Eddy Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 436-9333
Email: nate@eff.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Cindy A. Cohn
ELECTRONIC FRONTIER
FOUNDATION
815 Eddy Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 436-9333
Email: cindy@eff.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Kelly Harting
ROBINS KAPLAN LLP
800 LaSalle Avenue
Suite 2800
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Email: jkharting@rkmc.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mahesha P. Subbaraman
SUBBARAMAN PLLC
222 S. 9th Street
Suite 1600
Minneapolis, MN 55402
(612) 315-9210
Fax: (612) 315-9210
Email: mps@subblaw.com
TERMINATED: 06/30/2014

Mitchell L. Stoltz
ELECTRONIC FRONTIER
FOUNDATION
815 Eddy Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 436-9333
Fax: (415) 436-9993
Email: mitch@eff.org
TERMINATED: 04/15/2014

Richard M. Martinez
ROBINS KAPLAN LLP
800 LaSalle Avenue
Suite 2800
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Email: rmmartinez@rkmc.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Samuel L. Walling
ROBINS KAPLAN LLP
800 LaSalle Avenue
Suite 2800
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Email: slwalling@rkmc.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Scott A. Gilmore
CENTER FOR JUSTICE &
ACCOUNTABILITY
One Hallidie Plaza
Suite 406
San Francisco, CA 94102
(415) 544-0444
Email: sgilmore@cja.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sophia S. Cope
ELECTRONIC FRONTIER
FOUNDATION
815 Eddy Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 436-9333
Fax: (415) 436-9993
Email: sophia@eff.org
PRO HAC VICE

Defendant
**FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC
REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA**

represented by **Robert Phillip Charrow**
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP
2101 L Street, NW
Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 533-2396
Fax: (202) 261-0164
Email: charrowr@gtlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas R. Snider
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP
2101 L Street, NW
Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 331-3176
Fax: (202) 261-0114
Email: snidert@gtlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Interested Party

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

represented by **Michelle Renee Bennett**
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Civil Division
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 7200
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 305-8902
Email: michelle.bennett@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Page	Docket Text
03/05/2014	<u>1</u>		MOTION for leave to proceed in pseudonym by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A, # <u>4</u> Exhibit B, # <u>5</u> Exhibit C, # <u>6</u> Exhibit D, # <u>7</u> Exhibit E, # <u>8</u> Exhibit F, # <u>9</u> Exhibit G, # <u>10</u> Exhibit H)(td,) (Entered: 03/10/2014)
03/05/2014	<u>2</u>		ORDER granting <u>1</u> Motion for Order. Signed by Chief Judge Richard W. Roberts on 3/5/14. (td,) (Entered: 03/10/2014)
03/05/2014	<u>3</u>		COMPLAINT against FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA (Filing fee \$ 400, receipt number 4616062535) with Jury Demand filed by JOHN DOE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(td,) (Entered: 03/10/2014)

03/05/2014			Documents filed as to FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA. (rdj) (Entered: 03/10/2014)
03/14/2014	<u>4</u>		ORDER Establishing Procedures for Filing for Cases Assigned to Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly, signed on March 14, 2014. (SM) (Entered: 03/14/2014)
03/18/2014	<u>5</u>		MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Cindy Cohn, :Firm- Electronic Frontier Foundation, :Address- 815 Eddy Street, San Francisco, CA 94109. Phone No. - 415-436-9333. Fax No. - 415-436-9993 by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Cindy Cohn)(Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 03/18/2014)
03/18/2014	<u>6</u>		MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Richard M. Martinez, :Firm- ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P., :Address- 2800 LaSalle Plaza, 800 LaSalle Avenue, Minneapolis, MN 55402-2015. Phone No. - 612-349-8500. Fax No. - 612-339-4181 by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Richard M. Martinez)(Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 03/18/2014)
03/18/2014	<u>7</u>		MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Mahesha P. Subbaraman, :Firm- ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P., :Address- 2800 LaSalle Plaza, 800 LaSalle Avenue, Minneapolis, MN 55402-2015. Phone No. - 612-349-0165. Fax No. - 612-339-4181 by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Mahesha P. Subbaraman)(Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 03/18/2014)
03/18/2014	<u>8</u>		MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Samuel L. Walling, :Firm- ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P., :Address- 2800 LaSalle Plaza, 800 LaSalle Avenue, Minneapolis, MN 55402-2015. Phone No. - 612-349-8541. Fax No. - 612-339-4181 by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Samuel L. Walling)(Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 03/18/2014)
03/21/2014			MIJNUTE ORDER granting <u>5</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission of Cindy Cohn, CONTINGENT upon Attorney Cohn certifying to the Court that she is familiar with the Local Rules of this Court; granting <u>6</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission of Richard M. Martinez, CONTINGENT upon Attorney Martinez certifying to the Court that he is familiar with the Local Rules of this Court; granting <u>7</u> Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice of Mahesha P. Subbaraman, CONTINGENT upon Attorney Subbaraman certifying to the Court that Attorney Subbaraman is familiar with the Local Rules of this Court; and granting <u>8</u> Motion Admission Pro Hac Vice of Samuel L. Walling, CONTINGENT upon Attorney Walling certifying to the Court that he is familiar with the Local Rules of this Court. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on March 21, 2014. (SM) (Entered: 03/21/2014)
04/02/2014	<u>9</u>		AFFIDAVIT <i>Supplemental Declaration of Cindy Cohn in Support of Motion Under LCvR 83.2(d) for Pro Hac Vice Admission</i> by JOHN DOE. (Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 04/02/2014)
04/02/2014	<u>10</u>		AFFIDAVIT <i>Supplemental Declaration of Mahesha P. Subbaraman in Support of Motion Under LCvR 83.2(d) for Pro Hac Vice Admission</i> by JOHN DOE. (Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 04/02/2014)

04/02/2014	<u>11</u>		AFFIDAVIT <i>Supplemental Declaration of Charles M. Martin in Support of Motion Under LCvR 83.2(d) for Pro Hac Vice Admission</i> by JOHN DOE. (Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 04/02/2014)
04/02/2014	<u>12</u>		AFFIDAVIT <i>Supplemental Declaration of Samuel L. Walling in Support of Motion Under LCvR 83.2(d) for Pro Hac Vice Admission</i> by JOHN DOE. (Stoltz, Mitchell) (Entered: 04/02/2014)
04/15/2014	<u>13</u>		NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Nathan Daniel Cardozo on behalf of JOHN DOE Substituting for attorney Mitchell Stoltz (Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 04/15/2014)
04/15/2014	<u>14</u>		ERRATA <i>Correcting the Declaration of John Doe (ECF No. 1-1)</i> by JOHN DOE. (Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 04/15/2014)
04/16/2014	<u>15</u>		AFFIDAVIT REQUESTING FOREIGN MAILING by JOHN DOE. (Cardozo, Nathan) (Main Document 15 replaced on 4/17/2014) (znmw,). (Entered: 04/16/2014)
04/21/2014	<u>16</u>		REQUEST from Plaintiff for the Clerk to effect service of one copy of the summons, complaint, and notice of suit, together with a translation of each into the official language of the foreign state, by DHL, to the head of the ministry of foreign affairs, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1608(a)(3). (See Docket Entry No.: <u>15</u> to view document.) (td,) (Entered: 04/21/2014)
04/21/2014	<u>17</u>		CERTIFICATE OF CLERK of mailing one copy of the summons and complaint, together with a translation of each into the official language of the foreign state on 4/22/14, by DHL, to the agency or instrumentality of the foreign state, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1608(a)(3). (td,) (Entered: 04/21/2014)
04/29/2014	<u>18</u>		RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed as to JOHN DOE served on 4/28/2014, answer due 6/27/2014. (Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 04/29/2014)
06/27/2014	<u>19</u>		NOTICE of Appearance by Robert P. Charrow on behalf of FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA (Charrow, Robert) (Entered: 06/27/2014)
06/27/2014	<u>20</u>		MOTION to Dismiss by FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Memorandum in Support)(Charrow, Robert) (Entered: 06/27/2014)
06/30/2014	<u>21</u>		MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- John K. Harting, :Firm- Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi LLP, :Address- 2800 LaSalle Plaza, 800 LaSalle Ave., Minneapolis, MN 55402-2015. Phone No. - 612-349-8787. Fax No. - 612-339-4181 Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090-3764791. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of John K. Harting)(Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 06/30/2014)
06/30/2014	<u>22</u>		NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to JOHN DOE. Attorney Mahesha P. Subbaraman terminated. (Subbaraman, Mahesha) (Entered: 06/30/2014)
07/01/2014			MINUTE ORDER (paperless). The <u>21</u> Motion Under LCvR 83.2(d) for Pro Hac Vice Admission of John K. Harting is GRANTED. Mr. Harting shall register with this Court's CM/ECF system. Signed by Judge Colleen

07/17/2014	<u>23</u>	VACATED PURSUANT TO ORDER FILED 7/18/2014.....ORDER GRANTING as conceded Defendant's <u>20</u> Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Federal Rules 12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6). Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on July 17, 2014. (lcckk1) Modified on 7/21/2014 (znmw,). (Entered: 07/17/2014)
07/17/2014	<u>24</u>	MOTION for Relief from Judgment <i>Relief from Order of Dismissal Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 60(b)</i> by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 07/17/2014)
07/18/2014	<u>25</u>	ORDER. Plaintiff's <u>24</u> Motion for Relief from Order of Dismissal Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 60(b) is GRANTED. The Court's July 17, 2014 <u>23</u> Order dismissing this case without prejudice is VACATED and this case is REINSTATED. The Clerk of the Court shall docket Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's <u>24</u> Motion for Relief from Order of Dismissal Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 60(b) as Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint. Defendant's <u>20</u> Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to Federal Rules 12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6) is DENIED in light of Plaintiff's filing of an Amended Complaint. Defendant shall respond to Plaintiff's Amended Complaint by no later than AUGUST 4, 2014. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on July 18, 2014. (lcckk1) (Entered: 07/18/2014)
07/18/2014		Set/Reset Deadlines: Answer to Amended Complaint due by 8/4/2014. (dot) (Entered: 07/18/2014)
07/18/2014	<u>26</u>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT against FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA with Jury Demand filed by JOHN DOE.(znmw,) (Entered: 07/21/2014)
08/04/2014	<u>27</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>PLAINTIFFS FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT</i> by FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Memorandum in Support)(Charrow, Robert) (Entered: 08/04/2014)
08/18/2014	<u>28</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>27</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>PLAINTIFFS FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT</i> filed by JOHN DOE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order)(Walling, Samuel) (Entered: 08/18/2014)
08/28/2014	<u>29</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>27</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>PLAINTIFFS FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT</i> filed by FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA. (Charrow, Robert) (Entered: 08/28/2014)
11/19/2014		Case randomly reassigned to Judge Randolph D. Moss. Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly no longer assigned to the case. (gt,) (Entered: 11/19/2014)
01/12/2015	<u>30</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Thomas R. Snider on behalf of FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA (Snider, Thomas) (Entered: 01/12/2015)
03/17/2015	<u>31</u>	MOTION for Hearing re <u>27</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>PLAINTIFFS FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT</i> by JOHN DOE (Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 03/17/2015)
03/20/2015	<u>32</u>	RESPONSE re <u>31</u> MOTION for Hearing re <u>27</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>PLAINTIFFS FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT</i> filed by FEDERAL

03/23/2015		MINUTE ORDER: Upon consideration of Plaintiff's Motion for Oral Argument <u>31</u> , it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED. The Court will schedule an oral argument at an appropriate time. Signed by Judge Randolph D. Moss on March 23, 2015. (lcrdm1,) (Entered: 03/23/2015)
03/27/2015	<u>33</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name– Sophia S. Cope, :Firm– Electronic Frontier Foundation, :Address– 815 Eddy Street, San Francisco, CA 94109. Phone No. – 415–436–9333. Fax No. – 415–436–9993 Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090–4037909. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by JOHN DOE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration)(Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 03/27/2015)
03/30/2015		MINUTE ORDER: Upon consideration of Plaintiff's Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice <u>33</u> , it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED. Sophia S. Cope is hereby granted leave to appear pro hac vice in this case. Signed by Judge Randolph D. Moss on March 30, 2015. (lcrdm1,) (Entered: 03/30/2015)
06/15/2015		MINUTE ORDER: It is hereby ORDERED that the parties shall appear for oral argument on Defendant's Motion to Dismiss <u>27</u> on July 14, 2015, at 2:00 p.m. in Courtroom 21. Signed by Judge Randolph D. Moss on June 15, 2015. (lcrdm1,) (Entered: 06/15/2015)
06/15/2015		Set/Reset Hearing: A Motion Hearing is set for 7/14/2015, at 2:00 PM, in Courtroom 21, before Judge Randolph D. Moss. (kt) (Entered: 06/15/2015)
07/13/2015	<u>34</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Scott A. Gilmore on behalf of JOHN DOE (Gilmore, Scott) (Entered: 07/13/2015)
07/14/2015		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Randolph D. Moss: Motion Hearing held on 7/14/2015 re: <u>27</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>PLAINTIFFS FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT</i> , filed by FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA. Matter taken under advisement. (Court Reporter: Janice Dickman) (kt) (Entered: 07/15/2015)
07/15/2015	<u>35</u>	NOTICE (see document for details). Signed by Judge Randolph D. Moss on July 15, 2015. (lcrdm1,) (Entered: 07/15/2015)
07/28/2015	<u>36</u>	TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS before Judge Randolph D. Moss held on July 14, 2015; Page Numbers: 89. Date of Issuance: July 27, 2015. Court Reporter/Transcriber Jan Dickman, Telephone number 202–354–3267. Court Reporter Email Address: JaniceDickmanDCD@gmail.com.<P></P>For the first 90 days after this filing date, the transcript may be viewed at the courthouse at a public terminal or purchased from the court reporter referenced above. After 90 days, the transcript may be accessed via PACER. Other transcript formats, (multi–page, condensed, CD or ASCII) may be purchased from the court reporter.<P> NOTICE RE REDACTION OF TRANSCRIPTS: The parties have twenty–one days to file with the court and the court reporter any request to redact personal identifiers from this transcript. If no such requests are filed, the transcript will be made available to the public via PACER without redaction after 90 days. The policy, which includes the five personal identifiers specifically covered, is located on our website at www.dcd.uscourts.gov.<P></P>Redaction Request due 8/18/2015. Redacted

08/04/2015	<u>37</u>		NOTICE of Potential Participation by United States of America (Bennett, Michelle) (Entered: 08/04/2015)
09/25/2015	<u>38</u>		NOTICE by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA (Bennett, Michelle) (Entered: 09/25/2015)
05/24/2016	<u>39</u>		MEMORANDUM AND OPINION: It is hereby ORDERED that Ethiopias motion to dismiss <u>27</u> is GRANTED. See document for details. The Clerk shall enter final judgment. Signed by Judge Randolph D. Moss on 5/24/2016. (lcrdm1,) (Entered: 05/24/2016)
05/25/2016	<u>40</u>	10	CLERK'S JUDGMENT in favor of Defendant against Plaintiff. Signed by Kristin Thompson, Deputy Clerk, on 5/25/2016. (kt) (Entered: 05/25/2016)
06/22/2016	<u>41</u>	9	NOTICE OF APPEAL TO DC CIRCUIT COURT as to <u>40</u> Clerk's Judgment by JOHN DOE. Filing fee \$ 505, receipt number 0090-4577805. Fee Status: Fee Paid. Parties have been notified. (Cardozo, Nathan) (Entered: 06/22/2016)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

JOHN DOE, a.k.a. KIDANE,
Plaintiff

vs.

Civil Action No. 14-372 (RDM)

FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA,
Defendant

NOTICE OF APPEAL

Notice is hereby given this 22nd day of June, 20 16, that

JOHN DOE, a.k.a., KIDANE,

hereby appeals to the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit from

the judgment of this Court entered on the 25th day of May, 20 16

in favor of FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA

against said JOHN DOE, a.k.a., KIDANE.

/s/ Nathan Cardozo

Attorney or Pro Se Litigant

(Pursuant to Rule 4(a) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure a notice of appeal in a civil action must be filed within 30 days after the date of entry of judgment or 60 days if the United States or officer or agency is a party)

CLERK Please mail copies of the above Notice of Appeal to the following at the addresses indicated:

Robert P. Charrow
Thomas R. Snider
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP
2101 L Street, N.W., Suite 1000
Washington, D.C. 20037
Counsel for Defendant Federal
Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the District of Columbia

JOHN DOE a.k.a. KIDANE
Plaintiff
v.
FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA
Defendant

Civil Action No. 14cv372 (RDM)

JUDGMENT IN A CIVIL ACTION

The court has ordered that (check one):

- the plaintiff (name) recover from the defendant (name) the amount of dollars (\$), which includes prejudgment interest at the rate of %, plus postjudgment interest at the rate of %, along with costs.
the plaintiff recover nothing, the action be dismissed on the merits, and the defendant (name) recover costs from the plaintiff (name)
other: Ethiopia's Motion to Dismiss, Dkt. 27, is GRANTED.

This action was (check one):

- tried by a jury with Judge presiding, and the jury has rendered a verdict.
tried by Judge without a jury and the above decision was reached.
decided by Judge Randolph D. Moss on a motion for dismissal (Dkt. 27 Motion to Dismiss).

Date: 05/25/2016

ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT

Kristin Thompson
Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk